Women-Women Tradeoffs in Basic Income Regimes

Leticia Morales
Universidad Austral de Chile

BIEN 2023, Seoul
To reduce unequal treatment of women in the labour market?

To reduce gender violence and promote women’s standing inside and outside the family?
BI IS GOOD FOR WOMEN

- Well-being
- Autonomy
- Equal opportunities
- Standing of women across society
- Political participation and democracy

EXTERNAL APPROACH
Women as a group are pitched against men as a group
INTERNAL APPROACH

Women-women tradeoffs

Examination of tensions internal to women as a group

1) Horizontal tensions
2) Vertical tensions
3) Temporal tensions
Tradeoff different spheres of activities that women have an interest in

- E.g. labour market vs family, focusing on unpaid work and care labour

Finnish experiment: unemployed women (Olli Kangas & Minna Ylikännö, 2023)

“There is strong evidence that the cash-for-care home care allowance typically used in Finnish families with small children reduces female employment in both the short and long term.”

1. Horizontal tensions
2. Vertical tensions

Tradeoffs by pitching worse-off women against better-off women

• E.g. different levels of education, from non-educated vs. educated women, leads to distinct access to political participation and citizenship

BI as a way to readdress women pre-existing position of disadvantage in society (Lombardozzi, 2020)... but different groups of women occupy different position of disadvantage

• E.g. poorer women (low paid work, informal work) with a need for a decent floor to stand on vs wealthier women with an interest for changing social structures of gender discrimination (e.g., norms for parenting practices) (Koslowski & Duvander, 2018)

• E.g. domestic crimes (intimate partner violence) aggravated by poverty and deprivation, also economic dependency increases vulnerability (Calnitsky & Gonalons-Pons, 2020)
3. Temporal tensions

Tradeoff a positive impact in one part of the life-cycle against another

• E.g., BI as a marriage/reproductive bonus (pro-natal policy): pitching sexual and reproductive freedom early in life against stable social security later in life
It's not about placing internal versus external.

It is an additional analysis obscured by academia systematically focusing on the external tensions.
Women disaggregated data and information

Identification and consideration of the specific needs of different women

Identification and consideration of diverse women’s interests

Identification and consideration of women’s impact
What we should aim for women is a scenario where a social policy protects women and promotes their interests, well-being, autonomy and equal opportunities as best as possible across all these dimensions.

Where does BI fit in?
Different positions

- Give up on UBI?
- Defend complementary social policies above UBI/policy changes?
- Design a BI policy to answer challenges?
CONCLUSIONS

Diagnosis

External perspective of BI is insufficient

Thesis

Analysis from internal approach with focus in women-women
1) horizontal tradeoffs; 2) vertical tradeoffs; and 3) temporal tradeoffs, shows that BI is not a neutral policy

Consequences

- UBI has limits doing justice to different women
- Importance for disaggregated data
- Need to be aware of the non-neutrality of the designs of BI
Thank you!
감사합니다!